Increasing Broadcast Reliability for Vehicular Ad Hoc Networks

Nathan Balon and Jinhua Guo
University of Michigan - Dearborn
Introduction

• General Information on VANETs
• Background on 802.11
• Background on 802.11e for QoS
• The issues involved with broadcasting in a VANET
• A modified CW algorithm to increase the reception rate of broadcast packets
• Conclusion
Vehicular Ad Hoc Networks

• The goal of a VANET is to increase the overall safety of the transportation infrastructure.

• Automobile accidents are one of the leading causes of death in the US. To illustrate the severity of the problem of automobile accidents, there were 6,279,000 traffic accidents that accounted for 41,611 deaths in the United States in 1999.

• In 1999, the FCC allocated 75 MHz of bandwidth in the 5.9 GHz band to create a nationwide VANET.
Dedicated Short-Range Communication

- Dedicated Short-Range Communication (DSRC) refers to the spectrum allocated by the FCC for vehicular networks.
- DSRC aims to bring vehicular networks to North America.
- The program's goal is to create an interoperable standard for use in the US, Mexico, and Canada.
- DSRC will allow drivers to receive up-to-date information regarding their environment and as a result reduce accidents.
Requirements for a VANET

- A VANET must support high data rates.
- The latency must be low, 100 ms or less.
- The communication range of VANET is relatively small ranging from 100 m to 1,000 m.
- DSRC is intended to support both public safety and licensed private operations.
- No fee should be required to access the VANET.
IEEE 802.11p

- IEEE 802.11p is the standard for the PHY and MAC layer of DSRC.
- The MAC layer of 802.11p is based on 802.11a.
- Similar to 802.11a, the modulation scheme used for the PHY of DSRC is Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiplexing (OFDM).
### DSRC Channels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>5.850 GHz</th>
<th>CH. 175</th>
<th>CH. 181</th>
<th>5.925 GHz</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reserved</td>
<td>CH. 172 Service</td>
<td>CH. 174 Service</td>
<td>CH. 178 Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 MHz</td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CH. 176 Service</td>
<td>CH. 180 Service</td>
<td>CH. 182 Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CH. 184 Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10 MHz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Control Channel

- Channel 178 of DSRC is reserved for the control channel.
- The control channel is the most important channel of DSRC and efficient use of the channel is critical.
- The control channel is used to exchange service announcements, safety messages, and a vehicle's state.
- Communication on the control channel must last less than 200 us.
- Every 100 ms, each vehicle broadcasts its state on the control channel (e.g., direction, speed, location, etc.)
The data rates possible for a 10 MHz channels are:
- 6, 9, 12, 18, 24, and 27 Mbps

It is also possible to combine two 10 MHz channels to achieve a data rates up to 54 Mbps.
Communication Devices

• Each vehicle has an On Board Unit (OBU).
• The OBU consists of:
  – Transceiver
  – Omni-directional antenna
  – Processor
  – GPS unit
  – Digital Maps
  – Sensors
Communication Devices

- Road-Side Units (RSU) also exist within a VANET.
  - The RSU are strategically placed along the side of the road to provide services to vehicles.
  - The RSU's components are similar to those contained in an OBU.
  - A RSU may use either a directional or omni-directional antenna.
  - Also, a RSU can communicate with another RSU through a wired infrastructure. In turn, the communication between RSUs is more reliable.
  - Each RSU will require a license to operate that unit at a specific location and a specific frequency.
VANET Applications

- Traffic Signal Violation Warning
- Curve Speed Warning
- Emergency Electronic Brake Lights
- Cooperative Collision Warning
- Left Turn Assistance
- Precrash Warning
- Stop Sign Movement Assistance
The MAC layer for DSRC is based on 802.11.

The 802.11 standard defines two MAC protocols:
- Distributed Coordination Function (DCF)
- Point Coordination Function (PCF)

The DCF is an asynchronous contention based access protocol that is used with DSRC.

In a contention based protocol, all nodes that have data to send contend for access to the channel.

The PCF has contention free period during which the AP coordinates the transmission of the stations.
802.11

- 802.11 family of protocols uses Carrier Sense Multiple Access with Collision Avoidance (CSMA/CA).
- The DCF achieves collision avoidance with a random back-off procedure.
- The IEEE 802.11 standard uses the concept of slot time.
- When a node begins a transmission, it randomly selects the number of time slots it must wait before transmitting, which is known as the backoff window.
- Since there is no collision detection, the wireless transmission is made reliable with the introduction of an explicit acknowledgement.
802.11: Inter-frame Spacing

- 802.11 uses a number of different inter-frame spaces.
- The Distributed Inter-Frame Spacing (DIFS) is used before the transmission of both broadcast and unicast frames.
- When a node wishes to transmit a frame, it must wait for the timer of the DIFS to expire before attempting to access the channel.
- During this time, the wireless medium must remain free of transmissions.
- If a transmission is overhead while a node is waiting for the DIFS expire, the node defers its attempted access to the medium until the medium becomes free.
- The node must then restart its DIFS timer when the channel becomes free again.
Inter-Frame Spacing

Control frame or next fragment may be sent here

PCF frames may be sent here

DCF frames may be sent here

Bad frame recovery done here

ACK

Time
Back-off Process

- After the completion of the DIFS, a node begins a back-off process.
- When a packet is passed down to the MAC, it randomly selects the number of time slots it must wait before transmitting, which is known as the contention window.
- One clock tick of the back-off timer expires, when the medium remains free from transmission for one time-slot.
- The back-off timer is paused if the medium becomes busy.
- A node transmits when its back-off timer reaches zero.
Back-off Process

- The initial value of the CW is chosen randomly from the interval $[0, CW_{\text{min}})$.
- If the transmission fails the CW is exponentially increased until $CW_{\text{max}}$ is reached.
- CW Sizes (15, 31, 63, 127, 255, 511, 1023)
- If the transmission of a frame does not succeed after a predefined numbers of attempts the frame is discarded.
802.11 Backoff

Station 1
- NAV
- Random backoff (7 slots)
- CTS
- ACK
- New random backoff (10 slots)

Station 2
- NAV
- DIFS
- RTS
- SIFS
- DATA
- SIFS
- NAV
- Station defers

Station 3
- NAV
- DIFS
- Random backoff (9 slots)
- Station defers, but keeps backoff counter (=2)
- Station sets NAV upon receiving RTS
- SIFS
- ACK

Station 4
- NAV
- DIFS
- Station sets NAV upon receiving RTS
- DATA
- SIFS

Station 5
- SIFS
- ACK
- Station sets NAV upon receiving RTS
- SIFS

Station 6
- DATA
- Station sets NAV upon receiving CTS, this station is hidden to station 1
- SIFS
- Time
Hidden Terminal Problem

• One of the main problems affecting the reliability of the DCF is the hidden terminal problem.

• The hidden terminal problem occurs when there are two nodes that are outside the transmission range of each other, but each node wishes to transmit to a node that is shared between them.

• The problem is these nodes can not detect each others transmissions, so the medium appears free to both nodes.

• If Both nodes transmit at the same time the frame will fail to be delivered, and a collision will occur at the receiver.
Hidden Terminal Problem
To overcome the hidden terminal problem an optional Request to Send/Clear to Send (RTS/CTS) exchange was introduced into 802.11.

When a node has data to send, once it is able to gain access to the medium, the node will first transmit a RTS to the intended receiver.

When the node intended target receives the RTS, after a SIFS has expired, the node will respond with a CTS.

The nodes that overhear these control messages set their network allocation vector (NAV) for the amount of time it takes to complete the communication.

All other nodes will then defer from accessing the wireless medium until their NAV expire, and the transmission between sender and receiver is complete.
RTS/CTS
A requirement of DSRC is that safety messages must have priority access over non-safety messages.

In order to timely deliver high priority messages, such as those used by collision warning applications, DSRC adopts the Enhanced Distributed Channel Access of 802.11e.

EDCA provides differential access to the wireless channel by using eight priority classes, which are referred to as Access Categories (AC).

EDCA uses a different set of access parameters for each AC.
## Access Categories

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AC</th>
<th>AIFS</th>
<th>CW_{\text{min}}</th>
<th>CW_{\text{max}}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>511</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>1023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
802.11e Queues

Legacy: one priority

Higher priority

TC 7
TC 6
TC 5
TC 4

802.11e
up to 8 independent backoff instances

TC 3
TC 2
TC 1
TC 0

Lower priority

SCHEDULER (RESOLVES VIRTUAL COLLISIONS BY GRANTING TXOP TO HIGHEST PRIORITY)

Transmission Attempt
802.11e Backoff
• Broadcast messages will play a larger role than unicast messages in a vehicular environment.

• Some uses of broadcasting are as explained earlier to send emergency warning messages and to periodically broadcast a vehicle's state.

• When a frame is broadcast no ACK or RTS control frames are used.
Problems with Broadcasts

• No retransmission is possible for failed broadcast transmissions because of the lack of explicit acknowledgement for broadcast frames.
  – A failed unicast transmission detected by the lack of an acknowledgment (ACK) from the receiver.
  – If acknowledgments were used for broadcasts a problem known as the “ACK explosion problem” would exist, where each receiving node would at almost the same instance send an ACK back to the transmitter.
  – The “ACK explosion problem” results in a large number of collisions.
Problems with Broadcasts

• The hidden terminal problem exists because the RTS/CTS exchange is not used.
  - The IEEE 802.11 protocols use an optional RTS/CTS handshake followed by an acknowledgment to guarantee the delivery of a unicast packet.
  - Broadcast messages, on the other hand, cannot use the RTS/CTS exchange because it would flood the network with traffic.
  - All nodes that received the RTS would at almost the same instant respond causing a storm around the node that transmitted the RTS.
  - Because the RTS/CTS is not used channel reservation is not possible.
Problems with Broadcasts

- The contention window size fails to change because there is no MAC-level recovery on broadcast frames.
  - In order to control congestion, the contention window size (CW) is exponentially increased each time a failed unicast transmission is detected.
  - Because there is no detection of failed broadcast transmissions, the size of the CW fails to change for broadcast traffic as it does for unicast traffic.
  - Nodes will always transmit with $CW_{\text{min}}$ for the backoff window.
  - This may result in excessive collisions, if a large number of nodes are contending for access.
We rely on the observation that a node in a VANET is able to detect collisions and congestion by simply analyzing the sequence numbers of packets it has recently received.

In a VANET, each node will broadcast its status to its neighbors approximately 10 times every second.

While a node does not know if the packets it sent are correctly delivered, it knows the exact percentage of packets sent to it from its neighbors that are successfully received.

Based on this feedback, a node is able to dynamically adjust the parameters it uses, such as contention window size, transmission rate, and transmission power, to improve the delivery rate of broadcast messages.
On a crowded highway the number of vehicles contending to access the wireless medium can be high.

- For instance, on a gridlocked 8 lane highway with vehicles placed 15m apart, approximately 300 or more cars could be attempting to transmit (e.g., 600 m diameter / (15 m between vehicles * 4 lanes * 2 directions) ≈ 320 vehicles).

- Because a large number of nodes on the highway are contending for access to the medium, it is also necessary to vary the size of the contention window to reduce the likelihood of a collision.

- Vehicles can also benefit from the opposing situation where the contention window is decreased to account for light traffic.
Modified Broadcast Protocol

- The probability of collisions can be reduced and probability of reception can be improved if the size of the CW used to send broadcast messages is able to adapt based on the network conditions.

- If a node is able to observe its local conditions of the network, it will be able to modify the MAC level parameters to improve the probability that a frame is successfully received.

- While it is not possible to detect the collisions of frames, it is possible to record the successful delivery of frames.
The sequence control field is 2 Bytes.
  - A 12-bit sequence number is contained within the sequence control field.
  - It result in modulo-4096 counter that is incremented by 1 for each packet passed to the MAC.
Frames Received

| frames received from Node B | 32 | 34 | 35 | 36 | 37 | 38 | 40 | 41 |
| frames received from Node C |  7 |  8 |  9 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 |
| frames received from Node D | 15 | 16 | 18 | 19 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 |
| frames received from Node E | 62 | 63 | 64 | 65 | 67 | 68 | 69 | 70 | 71 |

- Node A records that it has overheard the frames coming from node B with the sequence numbers 32, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 40, 41.

- Based on the observed sequence numbers, node A could conclude that frame 33 and frame 39 were corrupted or lost.
Data Maintained by Each Node

• Each node then records the overheard sequence numbers coming from specific nodes.

• A dynamic hash table is used so that an entry is updated in near constant time. The MAC address is used as the key to the hash function.

• Each table entry has a timestamp associated with it. In order to prevent old data from affecting the calculation of the local network conditions. Old entries are removed from the table when the local reception rate is calculated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MAC Address</th>
<th>Sequence Number</th>
<th>Average Reception Rate</th>
<th>Timestamp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

The weighted reception rate is used to determine the percentage of packets that are successfully received from a specific node.

A weighted reception rate is used to put more emphasis on recent events.

Each time a frame is successfully received, the weighted reception rate is recalculated.

The variable $\alpha$ is used to put more or less weight on the current network condition.

$$\text{EstRecpRate} = \alpha \times \text{EstRecpRate} + (1 - \alpha) \times \text{SampRecpRate}$$
• The nodes also maintain a timer. When the timer expires, the local reception rate is determined and the CW is adjusted.

• The local reception rate is the average of the estimated reception rates.

  \[ \text{LocalReceptionRate} = \frac{\sum \text{EstReceptionRate}}{\text{Nodes}} \]
Contention Window Adjustment

- After the local reception rate is calculated, it is compared against the previously stored local reception.
- The node also maintains a threshold value that it uses to determine whether to increase or decrease the CW.
- If the new local reception rate decreases by a value greater than the threshold, the CW is increased.
- On the other hand, if new local reception rate increases by a value greater than the threshold, the CW is decreased.
- As a result, the CW adapts to the condition of the network.
- The node then uses the new CW for all broadcast transmissions until the next time the local reception rate is calculated.
CW Adjustment

IF (average – previous average ≥ sliding threshold)

    Increase the window

ELSE IF (-(average – previous average) ≥ sliding threshold)

    Decrease the window

ELSE

    Maintain the current window
Network Simulations

- The NS-2 network simulator was used to simulate the modified version of the 802.11 protocol.
- NS-2 is a discrete event simulator that is used for network research.
- The simulator was developed at University of California Berkeley and it is written in both C++ and TCL.
The mobility model used in the simulations is Freeway Mobility Model, and the USC Mobility Generator was used to create the mobility in the simulations.

- Each node in the simulation is restricted to only travel within its lane.
- The velocity of each node is temporally restricted based on the nodes previous velocity.
- A safety distance is maintained so that a node cannot exceed the velocity of the node in front of it if they are within the safety distance.
- Each vehicle’s velocity ranges from 17m/s to 25m/s.
- The acceleration of the vehicles is set to 10% the maximum velocity.
The first set of simulations that were evaluated varied the number of nodes in the simulation and used three traffic classes.

The default NS-2 physical layer parameters were used, resulting in 2 Mbps of bandwidth.

AC[0] = 2 slot \( CW_{\text{min}} = 31 \), AC[1] = 2 slots \( CW_{\text{min}} = 63 \), and AC[2] = 3 slot \( CW_{\text{min}} = 1032 \)

The overall reception rate for the whole simulation, was used to evaluate the performance of the protocol.

A 1000 m stretch of freeway was used to model the simulation.

AC[0] and AC[1] accounted each for 5% of the traffic and AC[2] accounted for 90% of the traffic.

Messages were transmitted at the rate of 100 ms.
Original Simulation Results

- **802.11e Reception Rate**
  - % Received vs. Number of Nodes
  - Lines for TC[0], TC[1], TC[2]

- **Dynamic CH Reception Rate**
  - % Received vs. Number of Nodes
  - Lines for TC[0], TC[1], TC[2]
Network Traffic

- AC[0] is used to transmit emergency warnings. Nodes are randomly selected to transmit an emergency warning and they are transmitted once every 100 ms for 1.5 s with 10% jitter.

- AC[1] is used to transmit a vehicle's state every 0.1 seconds with 10% jitter.

- Approximately 20% of the traffic is AC[0] and 80% of the traffic is AC[1].
Metrics Used to Evaluate Protocols

- Channel access time: the elapsed from when a packets is passed to the MAC layer until it is put on the channel.
- Reception rate: the percentage of packets successfully received at a distance $d \pm 5m$ from the sender.
Simulation Topology
The second simulation used a fixed CW. The simulation determined how the distance from the sender affects the reception rate and also how the number of nodes in the network affects the reception rate.

- **AC[0]** \( CW_{\text{min}} = 7 \) and \( \text{AIFS}[0] = 2 \)
- **AC[1]** \( CW_{\text{min}} = 15 \) and \( \text{AIFS}[1] = 3 \)
- The simulations shows that the reception rate decreases rapidly as the distance from the sender increases.
Fixed Contention Window: Reception Rate

MAC Reception Rate 200 Nodes 500 Byte Packets

MAC Reception Rate 400 Nodes 500 Byte Packets

MAC Reception Rate 600 Nodes 500 Byte Packets

MAC Reception Rate 800 Nodes 500 Byte Packets
Access Delay

![Access Delay Graph]

- **Traffic Class 0**: Red line
- **Traffic Class 1**: Green line

The graph shows the access delay in seconds as a function of the number of nodes. The delay increases as the number of nodes increases.
The Effect Different CW Sizes Have on Reception

• A third set of simulations was used to determine the effect that different values of $CW_{\text{min}}$ have on the reception rate.

• The results show that it is unlikely to be able to increase the reception rate by more than about 5%.

• One interesting finding was that a larger CW results in a lower probability of reception at large distances, while the reception is improved at short distances.

• For light network traffic the reception rate does not improved much as a result of varying the CW.

• For heavy traffic the rate improves but the queues can also fill up causing packets to be dropped and causing excessive delays.
Fixed Contention Windows

MAC Reception Rate for Static Contention Windows 800 Nodes

- CW 7
- CW 15
- CW 511
- CW 1023
Access Delay

Access Delay in Seconds

Contention Window Size

Access Delay

Orange Access Delay
I was preparing a final set of simulation that compared the a fixed CW against the dynamic CW, but the simulations did not finish in time to show the results.

It is highly likely that dynamically adjusting the CW will have a limited impact on the reception rate.

The previous results showed that a 5% to 6% increase can be expected by increasing the CW from $\text{CW}_{\text{min}} = 7$ to $\text{CW}_{\text{min}} = 511$ at certain distances.

The dynamic CW would likely result in even a lower this improvement in the reception rate.
Dynamically adjusting the contention window will improve the rate of reception under certain conditions.

If the amount of network traffic is close to the theoretical limit, it would be beneficial instead to drop some packets or adjust the rate that packets are transmitted at. In this case increasing the CW has a limited impact.
Future Work

- Adaptive Transmission Rate
- Dynamic Power Transmission Control
Adaptive Transmission Rate

- Due to the hidden terminal problem it is unrealistic to expect to achieve anywhere near 100% delivery of broadcast frames.
- In the case of a highly load network increasing the CW to 1023 slots will result in unacceptable access delay.
- In the case of a highly load network nodes will have to decrease their transmission rate.
- The feedback from the network can be used to reduce the transmission rate of low priority traffic.
Dynamic Power Transmission Control

- Controlling the communication range by adjusting the transmission power can be used to mitigate the adverse effects of highly dense nodes.
- The choice of the communication range has a direct impact on network connectivity.
- Most approaches use the node's density to estimate the transmission range.
- The transmission range can also be adjusted to keep the network load on the channel below a certain threshold.